Dessa Shapiro

Period 1

**Analyzing Arguments**

In recent years, J.K. Rowling has come under fire for transphobic remarks. After a protracted crossfire on twitter, she posted a [missive](https://www.jkrowling.com/opinions/j-k-rowling-writes-about-her-reasons-for-speaking-out-on-sex-and-gender-issues/)

[(Links to an external site.)](https://www.jkrowling.com/opinions/j-k-rowling-writes-about-her-reasons-for-speaking-out-on-sex-and-gender-issues/)

on her website responding to her detractors and attempting to clarify her position on the gender conversation. We will be analyzing Rowling's tweets, her letter, and various critiques (primary text, commentary and meta-commentary) to evaluate the strength of the claims, evidence and analysis swirling around this hot-button topic. We will not be discussing our personal views, but rather the integrity of the arguments presented. To begin, read Rowling's [letter](https://www.jkrowling.com/opinions/j-k-rowling-writes-about-her-reasons-for-speaking-out-on-sex-and-gender-issues/)

[(Links to an external site.)](https://www.jkrowling.com/opinions/j-k-rowling-writes-about-her-reasons-for-speaking-out-on-sex-and-gender-issues/)

, then fill out the following charts. As always, I recommend writing your work in a google doc before pasted it into Canvas.

**Rhetorical Situation**

| Exigence  -what inspired | The hate comments/ tweets she has received about herself and directed at her, also the judgment nd accusation of other people because of these actions. The trans community, and her general research and relation. |
| --- | --- |
| Purpose | To prove she is not transphobic/ a TERF, and supports genuinely trans people and the trans pride movements/ to show she knows about the subject and has some personal connection. Make her seem better, to defend herself. |
| Audience | He readers, supporters and mostly her haters, or people who have herd rumors about her being transphobic and other bead things about her/ The trans community and the people of social media she had mentioned. |
| Context | “For people who don’t know: last December I tweeted my support for Maya Forstater, a tax specialist who’d lost her job for what were deemed ‘transphobic’ tweets. She took her case to an employment tribunal, asking the judge to rule on whether a philosophical belief that sex is determined by biology is protected in law. Judge Tayler ruled that it wasn’t.”   * She talked about what she has gone through with the talk of her bein transphobic, saying that it was all for research and that she new this was going to happen when she supported some people with different beliefs, and some knowledge about the trans community, why she has done what she has. |
| Message  -main idea | She is not agents Trans people. And just hopes to further learn and understand the Trans community and gender identity in these times. And was overall misunderstood in regards to some social media. She si just concerned with the complications of transitioning for teens. |

**Argumentative Elements**

| Claim 1 | My interest in trans issues pre-dated Maya’s case by almost two years, during which I followed the debate around the concept of gender identity closely. I’ve met trans people |
| --- | --- |
| Evidence | I’ve been researching and learning, accusations and threats from trans activists have been bubbling in my Twitter timeline. This was initially triggered by a ‘like’. When I started taking an interest in gender identity and transgender matters, I began screenshotting comments that interested me, as a way of reminding myself what I might want to research later. On one occasion, I absent-mindedly ‘liked’ instead of screenshotting. That single ‘like’ was deemed evidence of wrongthink  I knew perfectly well what was going to happen when I supported Maya. I must have been on my fourth or fifth cancellation by then. I expected the threats of violence, to be told I was *literally killing trans people with my hate”* |
| Commentary | By including this evidence, she is showing her relation to some people who have caused her to be associated with being transphobic, and how it was not something she had done on purpose or with hateful intent. And it also depicts herself as a human and that she also has a lot to learn and that her curiosity lead to this whole event. |
| Claim 2 | So I want trans women to be safe. At the same time, I do not want to make natal girls and women less safe. |
| Evidence | I refuse to bow down to a movement that I believe is doing demonstrable harm in seeking to erode ‘woman’ as a political and biological class and offering cover to predators like few before it.  stand alongside the brave women and men, gay, straight and trans, who’re standing up for freedom of speech and thought, and for the rights and safety of some of the most vulnerable in our society: young gay kids, fragile teenagers, and women who’re reliant on and wish to retain their single sex spaces. Polls show those women are in the vast majority, and exclude only those privileged or lucky enough never to have come up against male violence or sexual assault, and who’ve never troubled to educate themselves on how prevalent it is.  I have a charitable trust that focuses on alleviating social deprivation in Scotland, with a particular emphasis on women and children. Among other things, my trust supports projects for female prisoners and for survivors of domestic and sexual abuse. I also fund medical research into MS, a disease that behaves very differently in men and women. It’s been clear to me for a while that the new trans activism is having (or is likely to have, if all its demands are met) a significant impact on many of the causes I support    young women wishing to transition and also about the increasing numbers who seem to be detransitioning (returning to their original sex), because they regret taking steps that have, in some cases, altered their bodies irrevocably, and taken away their fertility. Some say they decided to transition after realising they were same-sex attracted, and that transitioning was partly driven by homophobia, either in society or in their families.”  “he UK has experienced a 4400% increase in girls being referred for transitioning treatment. Autistic girls are hugely overrepresented in their numbers.”  between 60-90% of gender dysphoric teens will grow out of their dysphoria |
| Commentary | This give her some logos and supports her previous claim, that she was originally part of this community too do research and explain her own curiosity. It also gives facts( probably). Gives her argument that her is just concerted ( rightfully concerned) about the trans youth communities, but does not disprove of trans people. |
| Claim 3 | I relate and connect to the Trans community through my own personal experiences. |
| Evidence | “I remember how mentally sexless I felt in youth…..I happen to know a self-described transsexual woman who’s older than I am and wonderful. Although she’s open about her past as a gay man, I’ve always found it hard to think of her as anything other than a woman, and I believe (and certainly hope) she’s completely happy to have transitioned.” |
| Commentary | She is showing a personal relation and reflecting how she felt as a younger person, in order to defend her worries, and by explaining if it was more socially acceptable, she might have participated in this community, but then later regretted it when she found her connection to being a women. |